

**Patterns of telomere length
change with age in aquatic
vertebrates and the phylogenetic
distribution of the pattern among
jawed vertebrates**

Christopher Izzo

Presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at the School of Earth and
Environmental Sciences at the University Adelaide, South Australia

April 2010

“A gentle way to age”

...Carina Dennis (2006)

Declaration

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution to Christopher Izzo and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968. The author acknowledges that copyright of published works contained within this thesis (as listed below) resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.

- Izzo, C., Bertozzi, T., Donnellan, C. E. & Gillanders, B. M. (*In prep*). Telomere length varies independently of age in the Port Jackson shark, *Heterodontus portusjacksoni*: with a commentary on telomere length methods.
- Izzo, C., Bertozzi, T., Gillanders, B. M. & Donnellan, C. E. (*In prep*). Variation in telomere length of the common carp, *Cyprinus carpio* (Cyprinidae) in relation to age and tissue type.
- Izzo, C., Hamer, D. J., Bertozzi, T., Donnellan, C. E. & Gillanders, B. M. (*In prep*). Telomere length analysis for rapidly determining age in pinnipeds: the endangered Australian sea lion as a case study.
- Izzo, C., Gillanders, B. M. & Donnellan, C. E. (*In prep*). Telomere length of fishes correlates with variation in longevity.
- Izzo, C., Donnellan, C. E. & Gillanders, B. M. (*In prep*). Recent evolution of telomere length change with age in gnathostomes.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library catalogue, the Australasian Digital Theses Program (ADTP) and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Christopher Izzo
April 2010

***“Bad times have a scientific value.
These are occasions a good learner
would not miss”***

...Ralph Waldo Emerson (1837)

Acknowledgements

Thanks to all involved in the course of this thing.

Those in the SSEL and EBU labs provided me with an enjoyable three plus years of PhD-dom.

Special thanks to my supervisors, Bronwyn Gillanders and Steve Donnellan, whose combined support and direction was infinite, unrelenting and greatly appreciated.

My family, friends and Eloise – your unbounded patience, support and love drove me through this trying period. I am in your debt.

Thesis Abstract

Telomeres, the protective caps at the ends of all vertebrate chromosomes, naturally undergo changes in length. These changes in telomere lengths may be a “molecular clock” by providing a counting mechanism of DNA replication events. In populations of jawed vertebrates (gnathostomes), telomere length has been shown to change with age; and thus measurements of telomere lengths may provide a novel means of determining the ages of free-living animals. Determinations of the age structure of populations of aquatic vertebrates (teleosts, chondrichthyans and marine mammals) are vital for sustainable management and conservation efforts. Yet, the commonly applied increment based ageing techniques are limited by the subjectivity of increment patterning and destructive sampling. I aimed to assess the application of telomere length as an age determinate for populations of aquatic vertebrates and to evaluate the biological implications and evolutionary origins of this trait amongst the gnathostomes.

Telomere length change with age was investigated in an exemplar chondrichthyan, teleost and marine mammal species, to determine whether aquatic gnathostomes share the general pattern of declining telomeres with age, as found in terrestrial mammals. Chapter Two provides the first assessment of telomere length change with age in a chondrichthyan species, the Port Jackson shark. Four types of tissues from Port Jackson sharks, ranging in age from 0 to 17 years, were sampled and telomere length were estimated using three measurement methods: (i) relative quantitative PCR (qPCR); (ii) absolute qPCR; and (iii) the terminal restriction fragment (TRF) analysis. No relationship between telomere length and age was found for any of the tissues, using any method.

In Chapter Three, telomere length was measured in specimens of the common carp from two tissues using the absolute qPCR method. Telomere length measurements were then correlated with ages estimated from otolith increment counts and length-at-age calculations. Measurements of telomere length were highly variable in both muscle biopsies and fin clips; however, telomeres from muscle biopsies significantly increased in length – in contrast to the more generalised pattern of telomere length attrition and marking the second reported case of an increase in telomere length with age in vertebrates.

In terrestrial mammals telomere shortening is negatively correlated with donor age. In Chapter Four, I tested whether this pattern of declining telomere lengths was found in a pinniped species, the Australian sea lion. Telomere lengths were measured in flipper clips from specimens by absolute qPCR and compared between three age classes: pups, juveniles, and adults. Mean telomere lengths of the adults were significantly smaller than the juvenile and pup classes confirming that the Australian sea lion shares the general mammalian pattern of telomere length attrition.

Relationships between the rate of telomere length change with age and species longevity have been observed in birds and mammals, suggesting that the rate of telomere length change is an informative measure of ageing. In Chapter Five, using a data set of 20 teleost and chondrichthyan species, I tested whether fishes showed a similar pattern. I found that the rate of telomere length change with age is significantly different between species of fishes and that these rates of change are inversely correlated with longevity.

The findings of Chapters Two, Three & Four indicated that telomeres do not provide a suitable means of determining the ages of individuals and at best are limited to assigning broad age classes. This is largely due to the high degree of variability of telomere lengths between individuals within all age classes. In addition, these Chapters (2, 3 & 4) also highlight that patterns of telomere length change with age are highly variable within the gnathostomes; and thus, telomere length change cannot be characterised by a single pattern for all lineages. In fact, three patterns of telomere length change with age in the gnathostomes were found: (i) declining telomere lengths; (ii) increasing telomere lengths; and (iii) no significant change in telomere length with age. However, identifying the selective factors responsible for the assignment of patterns of telomere length change is hampered by a lack of the understanding of the evolutionary origins of these patterns.

Therefore, in Chapter Six I sought to outline the phylogenetic distribution of patterns of telomere length change with age in the gnathostomes to determine the evolutionary origin(s) of this trait. Two alternative hypotheses for the evolution of telomere length change were tested by ancestral state reconstruction in a set of 40 gnathostomes, for which I have significantly expanded the sampling of chondrichthyans and teleosts. The

most likely/parsimonious pattern of telomere length change in the common gnathostome ancestor suggested that telomere length change with age was not present ancestrally and has since evolved independently. I was also able to elucidate the evolutionary history of transitions to and between the three patterns of telomere length change within the available gnathostome lineages, with the birds and teleosts displaying the highest rates of evolutionary lability of patterns of telomere length change with age.

The macro-evolutionary analysis (Chapter 6) identified relatively rapid evolutionary patterns of telomere length change with age in two gnathostome clades. However, as highlighted by the variability of telomere lengths among individuals within all age classes, furthering an interpretation of the causes and consequences of variable patterns of telomere length change will require a focus at the species level and a shift to following individuals through out their lifetime.

Table of Contents

Declaration	3
Acknowledgments	5
Thesis Abstract	6
Thesis Preface	12

Chapter One **14**

GENERAL INTRODUCTION: Patterns of telomere length change with age in aquatic vertebrates and the phylogenetic distribution of the pattern among jawed vertebrate

- Increment based age determination of aquatic vertebrates 14
- Telomeres 15
- Telomere length change 16
- Taxonomic bias 18
- Variable patterns of telomere length change with age 22
- Evolutionary aspects of telomere length variation 23
- This thesis 24

Chapter Two **27**

Telomere length varies independently of age in the Port Jackson shark, *Heterodontus portusjacksoni*: with a commentary on telomere length methods

- Statement of Authorship 28
- Chapter Preface 29
- Introduction 30
- Methods 32
- Results 37
- Discussion 49

Chapter Three _____ **51**

Variation in telomere length of the common carp, *Cyprinus carpio* (Cyprinidae)
in relation to age and tissue type

- Statement of Authorship _____ 52
- Chapter Preface _____ 53
- Introduction _____ 54
- Methods _____ 55
- Results _____ 58
- Discussion _____ 64

Chapter Four _____ **68**

Telomere length analysis for rapidly determining age in pinnipeds: the
endangered Australian sea lion as a case study

- Statement of Authorship _____ 69
- Chapter Preface _____ 70
- Introduction _____ 71
- Methods _____ 73
- Results _____ 75
- Discussion _____ 77

Chapter Five _____ **81**

Rate of telomere length change with age in fishes correlate with species
variation in longevity

- Statement of Authorship _____ 82
- Chapter Preface _____ 83
- Introduction _____ 84
- Methods _____ 85
- Results _____ 88
- Discussion _____ 94

Chapter Six _____ **97**

Recent evolution of telomere length change with age in gnathostomes

- Statement of Authorship _____ 98
- Chapter Preface _____ 99
- Introduction _____ 100
- Methods _____ 101
- Results _____ 105
- Discussion _____ 109

Chapter Seven _____ **113**

GENERAL DISCUSSION: Understanding patterns of telomere length variability:
shifting our focus from the population to the individual

- Telomere based organismal ageing _____ 113
- Variable rates of telomere length change with age _____ 114
- *Chronological versus physiological age* _____ 115
- Shifting focus from the population to the individual _____ 116
- Evolutionary aspects of telomere length variability in gnathostomes _____ 117
- Conclusion _____ 119

Appendix One _____ **122**

Supporting Material

- Table A1: Sources of data for telomere length change with age in gnathostome chordates _____ 122
- Table A2: GenBank accession numbers for mitochondrial nucleotide sequence data used _____ 124
- Figure A1: Phylogram of gnathostome phylogenetic relationships _____ 125
- Table A3: Ancestral states inferred from maximum parsimony and maximum likelihood ancestral state reconstruction _____ 126

Literature cited _____ **128**

Thesis Preface

Note on Chapter Style

This thesis begins with a brief General Introduction (Chapter One) to telomeres and the factors that affect telomere length dynamics. The introduction also highlights the variable nature of telomere length change with age in the jawed vertebrates (gnathostomes) and the paucity of telomeric research in the teleostean and chondrichthyan lineages. Here the broad research objectives of the thesis will be established. The General Introduction is followed by five research chapters (Chapters Two to Six) addressing the outlined research objectives. Finally, the biological and evolutionary implications of the findings presented herein are addressed in the General Discussion (Chapter Seven).

The research chapters of this thesis have been written in a style suitable for publication in a scientific journal and can be read as separate studies, therefore there is some repetition in each introduction and in the methodological descriptions. Furthermore, as these chapters have co-authors they have been written in plural.

Each research chapter is preceded by a preface, which includes the chapter abstracts, to summarise the contents and guide the reader, as well as a brief preamble that presents information on the publication status of the chapter at the time of thesis submission, and describes the contributions of all co-authors to the research therein. Finally, the chapter acknowledgements are also provided.

All tables and figures appear embedded within the text and the numbering of figures and tables begins at one for each chapter to simplify referral to the results. All literature cited in the thesis chapter's have been compiled at the end of the thesis and not at the end of each chapter. Additional appendices provided are referred to in the text as appropriate.

“Picture an aglet...”

...the author

ag·let (ag 'lit) *n.* A tag or sheath, as of plastic, on the end of a lace, cord, or ribbon to facilitate its passing through eyelet holes and maintain end integrity