

09 D.NS  
W 6428



---

**Considering the evidence: What counts as the  
best evidence for the Post Harvest  
Management of Split Thickness Skin Graft  
Donor Sites?**

---

**Richard John Wiechula, RN, BA, BN, MNSc**

This portfolio is submitted as partial requirement for the  
award of the Doctor of Nursing  
Department of Clinical Nursing  
The University of Adelaide

**May 2004**

# Contents

List of Tables .....	VI
List of Figures .....	IX
Abstract .....	XIII
Statement .....	XIV
Acknowledgments .....	XV
Part 1: Portfolio Overview.....	1
Chapter 1. Portfolio Introduction .....	2
Portfolio aim .....	2
Portfolio theme .....	2
Portfolio structure.....	2
Chapter 2. Portfolio Background .....	4
Chapter 3. Portfolio Objectives and Methods .....	7
Objectives.....	7
Methods .....	7
Part 2: Post Harvest Management of Split Thickness Skin Graft Donor Sites: A Systematic Review .....	10
Chapter 4. Systematic Review Executive Summary.....	11
Chapter 5. Systematic Review Introduction .....	16
Chapter 6. Systematic Review Objectives.....	19
Chapter 7. Systematic Review Methods .....	20
Criteria for considering studies in this review.....	20
Search strategy for identification of studies .....	21
Assessment of methodological quality.....	22
Data extraction .....	23

Data analysis .....	23
Chapter 8. Systematic Review Results .....	24
Interventions relating to the post harvest management of STSG donor sites. ....	28
Interventions relating to the management of the infected STSG donor site.....	99
Interventions relating to the management of the STSG donor site following epithelial cover .....	100
Chapter 9. Systematic Review Discussion and Recommendations .....	101
Part 3: An Economic Evaluation of Alternate Interventions for the Post Harvest Management of Split Thickness Skin Graft Donor Sites. ....	109
Chapter 10. Economic Evaluation Abstract.....	110
Chapter 11. Economic Evaluation Introduction .....	111
Study aims.....	111
Decision making in healthcare .....	112
Evidence in relation to STSG donor site management .....	113
Chapter 12. Economic Evaluation Background.....	116
Evidence-based health care .....	116
The current role of economic evaluations in EBHC .....	117
Potential methods of incorporating economic evaluation into EBHC.....	118
STSG donor sites.....	121
Summary.....	122
Chapter 13. Economic Evaluation Methodology .....	123
Economic evaluation in health care .....	123
Chapter 14. Economic Evaluation Methods .....	129
Study overview.....	129
Study perspective .....	129
Data collection and preliminary analysis.....	129

Chapter 15. Economic Evaluation Results .....	138
Scope of condition at study sites.....	138
Comparison 1: Hydrocolloid dressings vs Paraffin gauze dressings: A cost effectiveness analysis.....	139
Comparison 2: Hydrocolloid, calcium alginate and retention dressing regimens: A cost minimisation analysis.....	145
Chapter 16. Economic Evaluation Discussion.....	153
Limitations.....	153
Comparison 1: Hydrocolloids versus paraffin gauze dressings.....	155
Comparison 2: Multiple moist wound healing products/strategies compared.....	157
Combining clinical and cost effectiveness results.....	159
Summary of discussion.....	160
Chapter 17. Economic Evaluation Conclusions.....	161
Recommendations for practice.....	161
Recommendations for research.....	162
Part 4: Portfolio Integrating the Findings .....	163
Chapter 18. Portfolio Discussion and Conclusions.....	164
Integration of studies.....	164
Conclusions.....	170
References .....	172
Appendix 1 - Publications Arising from Research Projects.....	185
1.1 Systematic Review Report.....	186
1.2 Peer Reviewed Article from the Systematic Review.....	187
1.3 Joanna Briggs Institute Best Practice Information Sheet (English and Italian Versions) .....	188
1.4 Abstraction of Best Practice Information Sheet.....	189
Appendix 2 - List of Portfolio Related Presentations.....	190

Appendix 3 - STSG Donor Site Products/Treatments used in this Review .....	191
Appendix 4 - Inclusion Criteria: Split Skin Graft Donors.....	193
Appendix 5 - RCT/II Critical Appraisal Form: Split Skin Graft Donors .....	194
Appendix 6 - References Excluded from Analysis .....	195
Appendix 7 - Data Extraction Form: Split Skin Graft Donors .....	197
Appendix 8 - Level of Evidence Ratings for the Systematic Review .....	200
Appendix 9 - Costing Tables for Interventions.....	201
Appendix 10 - ICD10 Codes Report .....	213

## Abstract

This program of research comprises two studies conducted as the research component of the Doctor of Nursing degree. The first study involved the systematic review of evidence in relation to the post harvest management of split thickness skin graft (STSG) donor sites. This review was in relation to evidence of clinical effectiveness. The results of the review indicate that traditional paraffin gauze dressings, still in use in some practice settings, should be abandoned in favour of moist wound healing dressing products. The review failed to demonstrate a significant difference in the effectiveness of specific moist wound products. The second study in the series examined the cost effectiveness of a range of alternative dressing products and strategies. The results indicate that potential savings could be made by avoiding the routine removal of dressings for inspection early in the healing process without any clinical indication to do so. The clinical effectiveness of this strategy has yet to be rigorously tested in comparative clinical trials.

In addition to the results of the individual projects a range of issues in relation to emerging trends in evidence based practice were explored.