

# Obstacles to the take-up of mental health care provision by adult males in rural and remote areas of Australia:

## A Systematic Review Thesis

---

Peter C Stroud MAPS MASCH

Psychologist

Joanna Briggs Institute

School of Translational Health Science

The University of Adelaide

Master of Clinical Science

Supervisor: Professor Jennifer Abbey

Associate Supervisors: Associate Professor Craig Lockwood, and

Dr Jared Campbell

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b> -----	<b>II</b>
<b>LIST OF TABLES</b> -----	<b>V</b>
<b>AUTHOR’S DECLARATION</b> -----	<b>VI</b>
<b>ABSTRACT</b> -----	<b>VIII</b>
INTRODUCTION/BACKGROUND: -----	VIII
METHODOLOGY:-----	VIII
RESULTS: -----	VIII
CONCLUSION:-----	IX
<b>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</b> -----	<b>X</b>
<b>INTRODUCTION</b> -----	<b>1</b>
CONTEXT -----	1
REVIEW QUESTION -----	3
EVIDENCE SYNTHESIS-----	4
THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK-----	5
DEFINITION OF TERMS -----	5
OBSTACLES -----	6
ADULT RURAL MALE POPULATIONS -----	7
<b>THE SYSTEMATIC REVIEW PROTOCOL</b> -----	<b>10</b>
BACKGROUND-----	10
REVIEW QUESTION -----	12
CRITERIA FOR CONSIDERING STUDIES -----	12
<i>Types of Studies</i> -----	12
<i>Types of participants</i> -----	13
<i>Types of intervention(s)/phenomena</i> -----	13
<i>Types of outcomes</i> -----	13
REVIEW METHODS -----	13
<i>Search Strategy</i> -----	13
ASSESSMENT OF METHODOLOGICAL QUALITY -----	15
DATA EXTRACTION -----	16
DATA SYNTHESIS-----	16
ANDERSON’S MODEL-----	17
EXTRACTION AND EXPLANATION OF OBSTACLES-----	18
<b>RESULTS</b> -----	<b>19</b>
CONTEXT AND BACKGROUND -----	19
REVIEW QUESTIONS-----	19
STUDIES FOUND AND REVIEWED -----	22
FINDINGS FROM QUANTATIVE ARTICLES REVIEWED-----	24
FINDINGS FROM QUALITATIVE ARTICLES REVIEWED -----	24
RESULTS OF TAKE-UP FACTORS - QUANTITATIVE RESEARCH -----	25
RESULTS OF TAKE-UP FACTORS - QUALITATIVE RESEARCH-----	32

RESULTS OF QUALITATIVE AND QUANTITATIVE FINDINGS - TAKE-UP FACTORS -----	35
THEORETICAL MODELLING -----	37
<i>Population Characteristics</i> -----	38
<i>Environment</i> -----	38
<i>Health Behaviour</i> -----	38
<i>Health Outcomes</i> -----	38
<b>DISCUSSION -----</b>	<b>46</b>
CONTEXT AND BACKGROUND -----	46
PERCEPTIONS OF MENTAL ILLNESS -----	47
RURAL AND REMOTE MALE HEALTH PRACTICES -----	47
OBSTACLES -----	48
OUTCOMES FROM REVIEW QUESTION -----	50
FREQUENCY OF HELP SEEKING BEHAVIOUR: QUANTITATIVE FINDINGS -----	50
ATTITUDES -----	51
COPING WITH DISTRESS -----	52
SERVICE UTILISATION-----	53
MEANING AND EXPERIENCE OF HELP SEEKING BEHAVIOUR: QUALITATIVE ASSESSMENT -----	54
DATA SYNTHESIS-----	54
HELP SEEKING-----	55
RESILIENCE FACTORS -----	55
STIGMA, CONFIDENTIALITY AND COST -----	56
HEALTH SERVICE USE-----	57
ANDERSON'S MODEL-----	57
TAKE UP FACTORS -----	57
POPULATION FACTORS -----	58
ENVIRONMENT-----	61
HEALTH BEHAVIOURS -----	62
HEALTH OUTCOMES-----	64
CURRENT STUDY-----	66
SUPPLY AND DEMAND FACTORS-----	68
IMPLICATIONS FOR PRACTICE: -----	70
IMPLICATIONS FOR RESEARCH: -----	71
ASSUMPTIONS, LIMITATIONS, DELIMITATIONS -----	72
CONCLUSION-----	74
CONFLICT OF INTEREST STATEMENT: -----	74
<b>REFERENCES -----</b>	<b>75</b>
<b>APPENDIX 1: APPRAISAL INSTRUMENTS -----</b>	<b>82</b>
QARI APPRAISAL INSTRUMENT-----	82
MASTARI APPRAISAL INSTRUMENT -----	83
<b>APPENDIX 2: DATA EXTRACTION INSTRUMENTS -----</b>	<b>86</b>
QARI DATA EXTRACTION INSTRUMENT -----	86
MASTARI DATA EXTRACTION INSTRUMENT -----	88

<b>APPENDIX 3: DETAILED SEARCH STRATEGY - PUBMED</b>	<b>90</b>
<b>APPENDIX 4. INCLUDED STUDIES</b>	<b>91</b>
<b>APPENDIX 5: LIST OF FINDINGS WITH ILLUSTRATIONS</b>	<b>93</b>

## LIST of Tables

TABLE 1: OBSTACLES TO THE TAKE-UP OF, MENTAL HEALTH-CARE PROVISION BY ADULT MALES IN RURAL AND REMOTE AUSTRALIA.-----	14
TABLE 2: NUMBER OF STUDIES FOUND AND RETRIEVED -----	22
TABLE 3: NUMBER OF QUALITATIVE STUDIES INCLUDED AND EXCLUDED-----	22
TABLE 4: FINAL ASSESSMENT OF QUALITATIVE STUDIES -----	23
TABLE 5: NUMBER OF QUANTITATIVE STUDIES INCLUDED AND EXCLUDED -----	23
TABLE 6: FINAL ASSESSMENT OF QUANTITATIVE STUDIES-----	23
TABLE 7: FREQUENCY OF MENTAL HEALTH SERVICES CONTACT BY GENDER -----	25
TABLE 8: COMPARATIVE FREQUENCY OF SYMPTOM DISABILITY AND ATTITUDE BY GENDER -----	26
TABLE 9: REGRESSION ANALYSIS OF LIFETIME HELP SEEKING FROM A GP FOR PSYCHOLOGICAL PROBLEMS-----	26
TABLE 10: SUMMARY OF THE PSYCHOLOGICAL DISTRESS MEASURES BY GENDER AND AGE GROUP -----	27
TABLE 11: SUMMARY OF THE FREQUENCY OF USE OF COPING MEASURES-----	28
TABLE 12: SUMMARY OF THE COPING MEASURES BY GENDER-----	29
TABLE 13: SUMMARY OF THE SIMULTANEOUS REGRESSION ANALYSIS FOR COPING MEASURES PREDICTING PSYCHOLOGICAL DISTRESS -----	30
TABLE 14: PROFESSIONAL HEALTH SERVICES USED FOR THE MOST SERIOUS CONDITIONS IN THE FOUR WEEKS PRIOR TO THE SURVEY -----	31
TABLE 15: QARI-VIEW DISPLAYING THE SYNTHESSES FOR THE REVIEW. -----	32
TABLE 16: CURRENT RESEARCH FINDINGS MATRIX -----	35
TABLE 17. IDENTIFIED BARRIERS TO MENTAL HEALTH TAKE-UP IN RURAL AND REMOTE AUSTRALIA ACCORDING TO CATEGORY AND DESIGN -----	36
TABLE 18: THEORETICAL MODEL – EXTRACTION AND EXPLANATION OF OBSTACLES -----	40
TABLE 19: SUPPLY SIDE FACTORS AND QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE STUDIES -----	44
TABLE 20: DEMAND SIDE FACTORS AND QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE STUDIES-----	44
TABLE 21: DEMAND AND SUPPLY SIDE FACTORS ACCORDING TO ANDERSON'S CATEGORIES-----	45

## **AUTHOR'S DECLARATION**

This systematic review thesis has been developed from a systematic review of the obstacles involved in the take-up of mental health provision by AARRMs. It has grown into an evidence-based explanation of the nature and significance of these obstacles. The review thesis has developed within the evidence-based requirements of the Joanna Briggs Institute, within the School of Translational Health Science, University of Adelaide.

Collaboration is acknowledged with the University of Adelaide and the Joanna Briggs Institute, and the author subscribes to the University and Institute definition of evidence-based practice, methodology and synthesis. The author declares that collaboration, support and utilisation of evidence from quantitative and qualitative meaningful and experiential research has been utilised in the preparation of this thesis.

The thesis conforms to the policies, practices and requirements of the University of Adelaide and the Joanna Briggs Institute, and no activities outside those scholarly requirements are incorporated within the presentation of this thesis for the degree of Master of Clinical Science.

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and, where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, to be made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

The author acknowledges that copyright of published works contained within this thesis resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Peter Charles Stroud, MAPS MASCH, Psychologist

## **ABSTRACT**

### **Introduction/background:**

Research and practice have suggested that mental health care, and mental health care practices and practitioners, along with mental health care systems, seem to be confronted with obstacles in the take-up and delivery of mental health-care services to adult males living in rural and remote areas of Australia. The aim of this systematic review thesis is to appraise and synthesise research evidence about these obstacles. These obstacles may influence the interaction between adult rural and remote dwelling males, and mental health care providers and mental health care systems. This thesis reviews and analyses health data from health systems, provider and recipient view points, through a critical analysis of the research literature published from 1995. This field of research has warranted further exploration and understanding in both qualitative and quantitative domains.

### **Methodology**

The qualitative and quantitative components of this systematic review thesis have considered studies which included adult males of all racial and cultural backgrounds residing in rural and remote areas of Australia. The quantitative component has considered studies which evaluated the nature, significance, causes of and remedies to obstacles to mental health care, and the nature and significance of such obstacles from both the provider and recipient points of view. The qualitative component has considered studies which explored the meaning and experience of obstacles from similar viewpoints.

### **Results:**

The outcomes of this systematic review thesis have led to the identification and description of four categories of obstacles which impact on adult males seeking mental health care in rural and remote communities of Australia. These categories are population characteristics, environment, health behaviour and health outcomes.



## **Conclusion**

Quantitative and qualitative data has revealed a constellation of statistical data and themes from men's perceptions and experiences that clarify the everyday nature of obstacles to the take-up of mental health care by rural and remote dwelling Australian adult males. Provider (supply side) and recipient (demand side) obstacles contribute to the factors involved in the demand for and supply of services and the under-use of mental health care services by adult rural and remote males in Australia. This analysis opens a fertile ground for future research in this field.

## **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

The author highly values the contribution of Professor Jennifer Abbey (Supervisor), School of Translational Health Science, Joanna Briggs Institute, University of Adelaide, and the University of Tasmania, Menzies Institute. The author also acknowledges the valuable contribution of Dr Melanie Attard (Associate Supervisor – January 2012 to October 2012), and Dr Jared Campbell (Associate Supervisor – October 2012 to August 2013). The author values the important contribution of Associate Professor Craig Lockwood in a variety of contexts to both the secondary review process of the systematic review and the preparation of the thesis. Ms Alicia Hopper is highly valued for her assistance with secondary review processes and her contribution with technical assistance and material production. Ms Linda Scipioni is acknowledged for her assistance with manuscript production and proof reading. The author also acknowledges the contribution of Professor Alan Pearson and staff and students of the Joanna Briggs Institute for their contributions to outcomes regarding this thesis.